

## Enhancing Maritime Security: Challenges and Strategies in Indonesia's Natuna Sea

Marliani Marliani

Universitas Proklamasi 45

Corespodence: [marliani645@gmail.com](mailto:marliani645@gmail.com)

<https://doi.org/10.31629/jmps.v1i1.6876>

Received: February 15, 2024 | Revised: March 09, 2024 | Accepted: April 25, 2024

### ABSTRACT

The Natuna Sea, a strategic region within Indonesia's exclusive economic zone, faces multifaceted maritime security challenges that threaten national sovereignty, economic interests, and regional stability. This abstract explores the key issues and strategic responses to enhance maritime security in this vital area. Indonesia's maritime security challenges in the Natuna Sea are driven by illegal, unreported, and unregulated (IUU) fishing, territorial disputes, and transnational crimes such as smuggling and human trafficking. The encroachment of foreign fishing vessels, particularly from neighboring countries, exacerbates the IUU fishing problem, undermining local economies and depleting fish stocks. Additionally, overlapping territorial claims, particularly with China, complicate Indonesia's efforts to assert its sovereignty and maintain peace in the region. To address these challenges, Indonesia has developed a comprehensive maritime security strategy that includes diplomatic, legal, and operational measures. Diplomatic efforts focus on strengthening regional cooperation through ASEAN and other multilateral forums to foster dialogue and build consensus on maritime security issues. Legal measures involve the enforcement of national and international laws, including the United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea (UNCLOS), to uphold Indonesia's territorial rights and combat IUU fishing. Operationally, Indonesia has enhanced its maritime patrols, surveillance capabilities, and naval presence in the Natuna Sea. The establishment of the Maritime Security Agency (Bakamla) and the deployment of advanced technology, such as unmanned aerial vehicles (UAVs) and satellite monitoring, have improved the detection and interdiction of illegal activities. Despite these efforts, challenges persist due to resource constraints, coordination issues among agencies, and the complex geopolitical landscape. This abstract underscores the importance of a holistic and adaptive approach to maritime security, integrating diplomatic, legal, and operational strategies.

Keyword: Maritime Security, Natuna Sea, Challenges, Strategies

### INTRODUCTION

The Natuna Sea, a crucial maritime region within Indonesia's territorial waters, has increasingly become a focal point of maritime security concerns. The primary issues addressed in this paper revolve around the escalating challenges of safeguarding this strategically significant area against illegal activities, territorial disputes, and maintaining sovereignty (Riska, 2017). The urgency of this issue is underscored by the rising frequency of illegal fishing, territorial infringements by foreign vessels, and the broader implications these activities have on national security and regional stability (Riyadi & Sari, 2019; C. M. Yang &

Tran, 2004). This paper aims to explore these maritime security challenges and propose viable strategies to enhance the security framework in the Natuna Sea (Hao et al., 2014).

To achieve this, the paper will first delineate the core issues at hand, providing a comprehensive background and situating the discussion within the broader context of existing literature and studies. A brief review of related works will highlight the originality and necessity of this study, distinguishing it from previous research by focusing on recent developments and emerging threats. Key aspects pertinent to the topic, such as the geopolitical significance of the Natuna Sea, the economic implications of maritime security, and the impact on local communities, will be examined (Anggraini et al., 2019; Jaya et al., 2024). The rationale behind addressing these aspects is to underscore their critical importance and the scientific contributions this paper intends to make.

The Natuna Sea, located in the northern part of Indonesia's Riau Islands, is not only a rich fishing ground but also a significant area for natural gas reserves. Its strategic location, adjacent to the South China Sea, further amplifies its geopolitical importance (Dillenia & Troa, 2016). Over the past decade, the region has witnessed a surge in illegal fishing activities, predominantly by vessels from neighboring countries (Sambuaga et al., 2023). These incursions not only deplete marine resources but also challenge Indonesia's sovereignty (Meyer et al., 2019; Yang & Zou, 2024). Moreover, the Natuna Sea is part of the broader territorial disputes involving the South China Sea, where overlapping claims by various nations, including China, Vietnam, and Malaysia, create a complex security environment (Darwis & Putra, 2022; Muna et al., 2023).

The Chinese nine-dash line claim, in particular, has led to repeated confrontations between Indonesian and Chinese vessels, exacerbating tensions and posing significant challenges to maritime security in the region (Fernandes et al., 2021). The Indonesian government has responded with various measures, including the deployment of naval and coast guard assets, enhanced patrols, and diplomatic efforts (Arsetyo, 2021). However, these efforts have met with limited success due to the scale of the challenges and the limitations in resources and infrastructure. Consequently, there is a pressing need for a comprehensive strategy that addresses these multifaceted security threats effectively.

The topic of maritime security in the Natuna Sea has been addressed by various scholars and practitioners, highlighting different dimensions of the issue. For instance, Bateman (2019) discusses the broader implications of South China Sea disputes on regional security, while Beckman (2020) examines the legal frameworks governing maritime boundaries and their enforcement challenges. However, these studies often focus on either the legal or geopolitical aspects without providing an integrated analysis that includes economic and local community perspectives. This paper seeks to fill this gap by offering a holistic view of maritime security challenges in the Natuna Sea, incorporating the latest developments and utilizing a multidisciplinary approach to propose comprehensive strategies (Batara, 2023).

The originality of this paper lies in its focus on recent incidents and the evolving nature of maritime threats, which have not been adequately covered in existing literature. By analyzing current data and trends, this study aims to provide actionable insights that can inform policy and operational decisions. The significance of addressing maritime security in the Natuna Sea cannot be overstated. As Indonesia's front line in the South China Sea disputes, ensuring the security of this region is paramount for national sovereignty and economic sustainability. Illegal fishing alone results in significant economic losses, estimated at billions of dollars annually, affecting local communities and the national economy.

Furthermore, the security of the Natuna Sea has broader implications for regional stability. As a key player in ASEAN and a pivotal maritime nation, Indonesia's ability to secure its maritime boundaries is critical for maintaining regional peace and security. By addressing

these security challenges, Indonesia can strengthen its position in regional security architectures and contribute to the stability of the broader Indo-Pacific region.

#### METHODOLOGY

This study employs a qualitative research methodology, supplemented by qualitative data where applicable, to offer a comprehensive analysis of maritime security in the Natuna Sea. The research process encompasses several critical steps. First, a thorough literature review is conducted, focusing on maritime security specific to the Natuna Sea and related regional issues. This review includes an examination of academic articles, government reports, and policy briefs to build a solid foundation of existing knowledge and context (Galvan & Galvan, 2017). Second, data collection is undertaken from diverse sources, incorporating official statistics on illegal fishing incidents, naval patrol reports, and economic impact assessments (Johnston, 2014).

This phase also includes interviews with experts in maritime security, government officials, and local community leaders, providing additional qualitative insights and perspectives that enrich the analysis. Third, the study involves detailed case studies of specific maritime security breaches in the Natuna Sea, aiming to understand the nature of these threats and the corresponding responses by Indonesian authorities. These case studies offer concrete examples of challenges and strategies in action, highlighting areas of success and those requiring improvement.

Finally, a comparative analysis is conducted, juxtaposing Indonesia's maritime security strategies with those of other countries facing similar challenges. This comparative approach seeks to identify best practices and potential areas for enhancement, drawing lessons from international experiences to inform policy recommendations. By integrating these research steps, the study aspires to present a nuanced and actionable understanding of maritime security in the Natuna Sea, providing a basis for informed decision-making and strategic planning.

#### RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

##### 1. Key Maritime Security Challenges

The Natuna Sea faces several interrelated security challenges, which can be categorized into three main areas:

- a. **Illegal Fishing:** The most immediate threat to maritime security in the Natuna Sea is illegal, unreported, and unregulated (IUU) fishing. Foreign fishing vessels, primarily from China and Vietnam, frequently encroach on Indonesian waters, exploiting marine resources and causing significant economic losses. The lack of adequate surveillance and enforcement capabilities exacerbates this issue.
- b. **Territorial Disputes:** The overlapping maritime claims in the South China Sea, particularly China's nine-dash line, pose a persistent challenge to Indonesia's sovereignty. Despite not being a claimant in the South China Sea disputes, Indonesia faces regular incursions by Chinese fishing and coast guard vessels, challenging its territorial integrity.
- c. **Transnational Crimes:** The Natuna Sea is also a conduit for various transnational crimes, including smuggling, human trafficking, and piracy. These activities not only threaten maritime security but also undermine regional stability and economic development.

Natuna Sea faces significant and multifaceted maritime security challenges that necessitate a comprehensive and integrated approach. The primary threat of illegal, unreported, and unregulated (IUU) fishing, driven largely by foreign vessels from China and Vietnam, underscores the need for enhanced surveillance and enforcement capabilities to protect Indonesia's marine resources and economic interests. Territorial disputes, particularly those involving China's nine-dash line, pose ongoing threats to Indonesia's sovereignty and

territorial integrity, requiring robust diplomatic and regional cooperation to mitigate these tensions.

Additionally, the prevalence of transnational crimes such as smuggling, human trafficking, and piracy further complicates the security landscape, threatening regional stability and economic development. Addressing these challenges will require concerted efforts across multiple fronts, including legal reforms, capacity building, community engagement, and international collaboration, to ensure the long-term security and prosperity of the Natuna Sea region.

## 2. Effectiveness of Current Strategies

The Indonesian government has implemented several measures to address these challenges, including increasing naval patrols, establishing a dedicated maritime security agency (Bakamla), and enhancing cooperation with neighboring countries. However, the effectiveness of these strategies has been limited by several factors:

- a. **Resource Constraints:** The vast maritime area of the Natuna Sea requires significant resources for effective surveillance and enforcement. Limited budget allocations and logistical challenges hinder the operational capabilities of Indonesian maritime forces.
- b. **Coordination and Integration:** Effective maritime security requires seamless coordination between various agencies, including the navy, coast guard, and fisheries department. However, bureaucratic inefficiencies and lack of integration often lead to fragmented efforts.
- c. **Diplomatic Engagement:** While Indonesia has engaged in diplomatic efforts to address territorial disputes, the complexity of the South China Sea dynamics requires more robust and consistent diplomatic initiatives. Strengthening regional alliances and participating in multilateral forums are crucial for enhancing maritime security.

In conclusion, while the Indonesian government has taken significant steps to address maritime security challenges in the Natuna Sea, such as increasing naval patrols, establishing Bakamla, and enhancing cooperation with neighboring countries, the effectiveness of these measures has been constrained by resource limitations, coordination issues, and the complexities of diplomatic engagement. The vast maritime area requires substantial resources for effective surveillance and enforcement, but limited budget allocations and logistical challenges impede the operational capabilities of Indonesian maritime forces.

Additionally, the need for seamless coordination between various agencies is hampered by bureaucratic inefficiencies and lack of integration, leading to fragmented efforts. Furthermore, the intricate dynamics of the South China Sea disputes necessitate more robust and consistent diplomatic initiatives. Strengthening regional alliances and actively participating in multilateral forums are essential for achieving comprehensive maritime security. To overcome these challenges, Indonesia must prioritize resource allocation, enhance inter-agency coordination, and adopt a more proactive diplomatic approach.

## 3. Policy Recommendations

To enhance maritime security in the Natuna Sea, a comprehensive strategy is necessary, encompassing enhanced surveillance and enforcement, capacity building and training, community engagement, strengthening legal frameworks, and diplomatic and regional cooperation. Investing in advanced surveillance technologies, such as satellite monitoring and unmanned aerial vehicles (UAVs), alongside increasing the presence of maritime patrol vessels and improving the operational readiness of the navy and coast guard, will significantly enhance the detection and deterrence of illegal activities.

Moreover, specialized training for maritime security personnel and improved coordination between different agencies are crucial for the effectiveness of maritime

operations. Joint exercises with regional partners can further build capacity and foster cooperation. Engaging local communities in maritime security efforts can provide valuable intelligence and support, with initiatives such as community-based monitoring programs and economic incentives for legal fishing practices helping to reduce illegal activities.

Additionally, updating and harmonizing maritime laws and regulations to align with international standards will enhance enforcement capabilities, while clear protocols for handling maritime security incidents and prosecuting offenders are vital. Strengthening diplomatic efforts to address territorial disputes and engaging in regional security frameworks, such as the ASEAN Regional Forum (ARF) and the East Asia Summit (EAS), can bolster collective security measures. Promoting confidence-building measures and dialogue with China and other claimant states is essential for reducing tensions and fostering cooperation.

#### 4. Maritime Security Challenges and Obstacles in the Natuna Sea

Maritime security in the Natuna Sea, part of the broader South China Sea region, has become an increasingly prominent issue in international relations and regional security. The Natuna Sea is strategically located and rich in resources, making it a focal point of geopolitical tensions, particularly among Southeast Asian countries and major powers such as China and the United States. This paper aims to provide a comprehensive analysis of the challenges and obstacles to maritime security in the Natuna Sea, considering historical context, geopolitical dynamics, legal frameworks, and regional cooperation efforts.

- a. Geopolitical Significance of the Natuna Sea; The Natuna Sea, located in the southern part of the South China Sea, is significant due to its strategic location and abundant natural resources, including fisheries and potential hydrocarbon reserves. The sea is bordered by Indonesia's Riau Islands province, which includes the Natuna Islands, a critical outpost for Indonesia in maintaining its territorial sovereignty and economic interests. The region's geopolitical importance is further heightened by its proximity to major shipping lanes, through which a significant portion of global maritime trade passes.
- b. Historical Context of Territorial Disputes; The territorial disputes in the Natuna Sea are part of the broader South China Sea conflict, involving overlapping claims by several countries, including China, Vietnam, the Philippines, Malaysia, Brunei, and Indonesia. While Indonesia does not consider itself a claimant state in the South China Sea dispute, it has faced challenges related to China's expansive claims, particularly those outlined by the "Nine-Dash Line." This demarcation, which China uses to assert historical rights over most of the South China Sea, overlaps with Indonesia's exclusive economic zone (EEZ) around the Natuna Islands, leading to periodic confrontations and heightened tensions.
- c. Legal Framework and UNCLOS; The United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea (UNCLOS) provides the primary legal framework for addressing maritime disputes and establishing maritime boundaries. Indonesia ratified UNCLOS in 1986, which supports its claims to an EEZ extending 200 nautical miles from its baselines. However, China's interpretation of historical rights, as reflected in the Nine-Dash Line, has created legal ambiguities and conflicts with UNCLOS provisions. The 2016 Permanent Court of Arbitration ruling in favor of the Philippines against China clarified that the Nine-Dash Line has no legal basis under international law, yet China has continued to reject the ruling, complicating efforts to resolve disputes through legal means.
- d. Security Challenges and Military Presence; The Natuna Sea has witnessed an increasing military presence and maritime security challenges due to the ongoing territorial disputes. Indonesia has strengthened its military capabilities in the region, establishing a new military base on the Natuna Islands and increasing patrols to safeguard its sovereignty and resources. The presence of Chinese fishing vessels, often accompanied by coast guard ships, has led to several confrontations with Indonesian authorities, raising concerns about



potential escalation and the risks of miscalculation. Moreover, the involvement of external powers, notably the United States, has added another layer of complexity to the security dynamics. The U.S. conducts freedom of navigation operations (FONOPs) in the South China Sea to challenge what it views as excessive maritime claims by China. These operations, while aimed at upholding international law and freedom of navigation, have been met with strong opposition from China, further contributing to the region's militarization and heightening the risk of conflict.

- e. **Economic Implications and Resource Management;** The economic implications of maritime security in the Natuna Sea are significant, particularly concerning fisheries and potential hydrocarbon resources. The waters around the Natuna Islands are among the richest fishing grounds in the region, supporting the livelihoods of local communities and contributing to Indonesia's national economy. However, illegal, unreported, and unregulated (IUU) fishing by foreign vessels, primarily from China, poses a serious threat to these resources, undermining sustainable management and conservation efforts. In addition to fisheries, the potential for hydrocarbon exploration and extraction in the Natuna Sea has attracted considerable interest. Indonesia has been exploring the feasibility of developing these resources to enhance its energy security and economic development. However, overlapping claims and the risk of confrontations with China complicate these efforts, necessitating careful navigation of both legal and diplomatic challenges.
- f. **Regional Cooperation and ASEAN's Role;** Regional cooperation is crucial for addressing the complex security challenges in the Natuna Sea. The Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN) plays a pivotal role in fostering dialogue and cooperation among member states and external partners. ASEAN has sought to promote a rules-based order and peaceful resolution of disputes through mechanisms such as the ASEAN Regional Forum (ARF) and the ASEAN-China Dialogue. However, the effectiveness of these initiatives has been limited by divergent national interests and the absence of a unified stance on the South China Sea disputes. The ASEAN-China Code of Conduct (COC) negotiations, aimed at establishing a framework to manage and prevent conflicts in the South China Sea, represent a critical step towards enhancing regional security. While progress has been slow, the COC has the potential to provide a more structured and predictable environment for managing disputes and promoting cooperation. Nonetheless, the success of the COC will depend on the political will of all parties involved and their commitment to upholding international law.

Maritime security in the Natuna Sea presents a multifaceted challenge that requires a holistic and cooperative approach. The region's geopolitical significance, coupled with legal ambiguities and resource competition, necessitates robust national and regional strategies to ensure stability and security. Indonesia's efforts to strengthen its military capabilities, assert its legal rights, and promote regional cooperation are critical steps in addressing these challenges. However, the success of these initiatives will depend on the political will and commitment of all stakeholders to uphold international law, foster dialogue, and work towards sustainable solutions. As the Natuna Sea continues to be a flashpoint in the broader South China Sea disputes, maintaining peace and security in the region remains a key priority for Indonesia and the international community.

## CONCLUSION

Enhancing maritime security in Indonesia's Natuna Sea is a complex and multifaceted challenge that requires a comprehensive and integrated approach. By addressing the key challenges of illegal fishing, territorial disputes, and transnational crimes through enhanced surveillance, capacity building, community engagement, legal reforms, and diplomatic initiatives, Indonesia can strengthen its maritime security framework and contribute to

regional stability. The proposed strategies and policy recommendations aim to provide actionable insights for policymakers and stakeholders, emphasizing the critical importance of securing the Natuna Sea for Indonesia's sovereignty, economic sustainability, and regional peace. This study underscores the need for continued research and collaboration to develop innovative solutions and adapt to evolving maritime security threats.

Based on the comprehensive analysis and conclusions drawn, the following recommendations are proposed to enhance maritime security in Indonesia's Natuna Sea, Invest in advanced surveillance technologies, including satellite monitoring and unmanned aerial vehicles (UAVs), to improve real-time detection and deterrence of illegal activities. Develop an integrated maritime surveillance system that enables seamless data sharing and coordination among the navy, coast guard, and other relevant agencies. Provide specialized training programs for maritime security personnel to improve their operational capabilities and response efficiency. Facilitate joint exercises and training sessions with regional partners to enhance cooperation and readiness in addressing maritime security threats. By implementing these recommendations, Indonesia can strengthen its maritime security framework, safeguard its sovereignty, ensure economic sustainability, and contribute to regional peace and stability in the Natuna Sea.

## REFERENCES

- Anggraini, S. D., Kusumawardhana, I., & Ramadhan, I. (2019). The Implication of Indonesia's IUU Fishing Policy in Natuna Territorial Waters towards South China Sea Geopolitics. *Jurnal Hubungan Internasional*, 7(2), 118–132. <https://doi.org/10.18196/HI.72130>
- Arsetyo, Y. I. C. (2021). Pengelolaan Kedaulatan Wilayah Udara Indonesia di Natuna berdasarkan Konvensi Chicago 1944 dalam Perspektif Hukum Internasional. *DEFENDONESIA*, 5(1), 46–55. <https://doi.org/10.54755/DEFENDONESIA.V5I1.102>
- Batara, H. (2023). Optimizing the Development of Maritime Defense In The Natuna Sea in Realizing Indonesia as The World Maritime Axis. *Journal of Industrial Engineering & Management Research*, 4(2), 93–101. <https://doi.org/10.7777/JIEMAR.V4I2.468>
- Darwis, D., & Putra, B. A. (2022). Construing Indonesia's maritime diplomatic strategies against Vietnam's illegal, unreported, and unregulated fishing in the North Natuna Sea. *Asian Affairs: An American Review*, 49(4), 172–192. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00927678.2022.2089524>
- Dillenia, I., & Troa, R. A. (2016). Identifikasi Situs Kapal Karam Bersejarah "Karang Panjang" Di Perairan Pulau Laut Natuna. *Jurnal Kelautan Nasional*, 11(1), 11–20. <https://doi.org/10.15578/JKN.V11I1.6063>
- Fernandes, I., Daulay, Z., Ferdi, F., & Delfiyanti, D. (2021). Status of Indonesia's sovereign rights in the north natuna sea conflict area consequences of China's nine-dash line claim. *Linguistics and Culture Review*, 5(S3), 1775–1783. <https://doi.org/10.21744/LINGCURE.V5NS3.2051>
- Galvan, J. L., & Galvan, M. C. (2017). *Writing literatur reviews: A guide for student of the social and behavior sciences* (7th ed.). Routledge.
- Hao, Q., Sun, Y. X., Xu, X. R., Yao, Z. W., Wang, Y. S., Zhang, Z. W., Luo, X. J., & Mai, B. X. (2014). Occurrence of persistent organic pollutants in marine fish from the Natuna Island, South China Sea. *Marine Pollution Bulletin*, 85(1), 274–279. <https://doi.org/10.1016/J.MARPOLBUL.2014.05.058>
- Jaya, B. P. M., Permana, A. P. S., Fasyehudin, M., & Solapari, N. (2024). Republic of Indonesia Sovereign Right in North Natuna Sea according to United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea 1982. *Australian Journal of Maritime & Ocean Affairs*, 16(1), 127–140. <https://doi.org/10.1080/18366503.2023.2206261>

- Johnston, M. P. (2014). Secondary Data Analysis: A Method of which the Time Has Come. *Qualitative and Quantitative Methods in Libraries*, 3(3), 619–626. <http://www.qqml-journal.net/index.php/qqml/article/view/169>
- Meyer, P. K., Nurmandi, A., & Agustiyara, A. (2019). Indonesia's swift securitization of the Natuna Islands how Jakarta countered China's claims in the South China Sea. *Asian Journal of Political Science*, 27(1), 70–87. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02185377.2019.1590724>
- Muna, R. A. A., Ras, A. R., Rudiyanto, Widodo, P., Saragih, H. J. R., & Suwarno, P. (2023). Sea Power Indonesia Related to Geopolitics in The South China Sea and Geoeconomics in the North Natuna Sea Sloc & Slit. *Jurnal Kewarganegaraan*, 7(1), 735–741. <https://doi.org/10.31316/JK.V7I1.4892>
- Riska, E. (2017). Diplomasi Maritim Indonesia Terhadap Aktivitas Penangkapan Ikan Ilegal (Illegal Fishing) oleh Nelayan China di ZEE Perairan Kepulauan Natuna. *Jurnal Diplomasi Pertahanan*, 3(2), 33–47. <https://doi.org/10.33172/JDP.V3I2.87>
- Riyadi, R. A., & Sari, D. A. A. (2019). Pemuktahiran peta dikawasan laut Natuna utara sebagai langkah Indonesia menjadi poros maritim dunia. *Jurnal Hukum Internasional: Belli Ac Pacis*, 5(1).
- Sambuaga, T. L., Octavian, A., Supriyadi, A. A., & Sumertha, I. G. (2023). Good governance strategy in maintaining the national interest of state defense: a study in the North Natuna sea region. *JPPPI (Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Indonesia)*, 9(3), 1281–1290. <https://doi.org/10.29210/020232501>
- Yang, C. M., & Tran, A. D. (2004). The aquatic bugs (heteroptera) of Natuna and Anambas Island. *The Raffles Bulletin of Zoology*, 11, 55–59.
- Yang, Y., & Zou, Y. (2024). Development and national security: Indonesia's Natuna Island and the South China Sea issue. *Third World Quarterly*, 45(3), 493–512. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01436597.2023.2270507>