

Reshaping The State: Bureaucracy, Modernity and Postmodernity Perspective In The Progressive Era

Lambertha Gundalibra Sari 

Department Public Administration, Universitas Brawijaya, East Java. Indonesia

*Correspondence : lambertha@student.ub.ac.id

ARTICLE INFO

Article History

Submitted; [March 31, 2022](#)

Revised; [April 10, 2022](#)

Accepted; [April 25, 2022](#)

Available online: [April 30, 2022](#)

Keyword

Bureaucracy

Modern

Postmodern

Progressive Era

ABSTRACT

This article aimed to described how reshaping the state in the border of bureaucratic modern, and postmodern perspective the progressive era that has been done, both in Indonesia, and other countries in the world. This is important to provide a comprehensive understanding of the concern of reshaping the state in the bureaucratic modern, and postmodern perspective. The research method used in this paper was literature review obtained from various resources related bureaucracy, modernity, and postmodernity in order to reshaping the state in better form. The result of this research according to bureaucratic theory, the main strength of bureaucracy is its expertise in a particular field which is also a key tool for public policy decisions. Meanwhile, according to the theory of a modern perspective, public services that prioritize the use of technology and uphold the value of individuality will cause one's worries and anxiety. It is different from the postmodern perspective theory, this theory has given fresh air to a country to build its nation according to its local potential, because postmodern appreciates it.



This work is licensed under a Creative Common Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International License.

INTRODUCTION

The first is to boost digital connectivity and universalize access to high quality internet through efforts such as improving clarity of regulations around the sharing of telecom infrastructure. The second priority is to ensure that the digital economy works for all. This can be supported by better logistics and greater investment in relevant skills for the digital era. The third priority is using digital technologies to provide better public services, improve the quality of citizen-and-state interactions, and build trust in the digital world. Despite the progress in expanding internet over the past decade, the basic connectivity gap remains a major hurdle in Indonesia. Indonesia has made significant headway in transitioning from the classical administration period to the digital age as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic ([Olivia et al., 2020](#); [Susilawati et al., 2020](#)).

All industries have now made the transition from manual to digital with all of the benefits it entails ([Ackermann & Eden, 2011](#); [Rüland, 2021](#)). The COVID-19 pandemic has deeply impacted the lives of Indonesian citizens. Work has become scarce, businesses are suffering, schools experience great difficulty in providing good education, and medical care has now become a luxury. Indonesia's economy is affected so much that most tourism industries have

come to a halt. This has created a big problem because Indonesia has been rather dependent on the tourism industry. Industrial sectors that are the prime movers of economic growth are the chemical industries, the pharmaceutical and traditional medication industries, furniture industries, rubber industries, and plastic industries, machinery industries, as well as the food and beverage industry.

Similarly to the science of public administration, all services are currently transitioning from physical to virtual activity ([Crew & Kleindorfer, 1999](#); [Sheth, 2020](#)). This will be very advantageous in terms of efficacy and timeliness. Naturally, such activities will benefit the development of a country with an ordered government ([Evans & Yen, 2005](#); [Wunder et al., 2008](#)). Administrative science has existed theoretically for a long period of time, but it was not until the late nineteenth or early twentieth centuries that it was scientifically evaluated and then data was gathered and organised in a field known as administrative science ([Astley, 2019](#); [Bicalho et al., 2017](#)). According to Max Weber, cooperative activities are a well-known social phenomena in a variety of cultures ([Weber, 1947](#)).

Around 1300 BC, the Egyptians, for example, were familiar with bureaucratic management. It was the same in ancient China, which was familiar with government management as a consequence of being inspired by Confucius' teachings ([Hamilton & Biggart, 2015](#); [Santagata, 2006](#)). Then there was Greece in 430 BC with a democratic governance structure of the state, Rome with Marcus Tullius Cicero's "De Officiis" and "De Legibus"; and 17th century Austria, Germany, and France with the Cameracensians, who developed the science of state administration, such as the bookkeeping system in the case of state financial administration, the Mercantilists (centralisation of the economy and politics), and the Physiocrats, who were influential between 1550 and 1700. The histories, Progressivism is an umbrella label for a wide range of economic, political, social, and moral reforms.

These included efforts to outlaw the sale of alcohol; regulate child labor and sweatshops; scientifically manage natural resources; insure pure and wholesome water and milk; Americanize immigrants or restrict immigration altogether; and bust or regulate trusts. Drawing support from the urban, college-educated middle class, Progressive reformers sought to eliminate corruption in government, regulate business practices, address health hazards, and improve working conditions. They also fought to give the public more direct control over government through direct primaries to nominate candidates for public office, direct election of senators, the initiative, referendum, and recall, and women's suffrage. Thus, we know that the advancement of administrative science will have a significant impact on a country's order, This will have an effect on a nation's performance ([Davis, 2015](#); [Song & Shin, 2008](#)).

It is well established that administration in the early classical period was dominated by anti-business, anti-achievement, and anti-corporate ideals. In other words, employees prefer to do jobs alone rather than together. Indeed, if this is applied to the twenty-first century in its current form, it becomes less relevant. Currently, rapid and accurate labour is required for a country's development ([Brinkerhoff & Brinkerhoff, 2015](#); [Sergi et al., 2019](#)). Smith reasoned that division of labour might (1) increase each worker's talents and dexterity, (2) save time spent changing activities, and (3) inspire the creation of machines and other labor-saving devices. Our element serves as the backdrop for this study. Delays in completing a nation's administration will have a detrimental effect on the country. As a result, it is required to reorganise a country's internal circumstances.

The industrial revolution in England was the next significant event that affected administrative science, since it represented the beginning of the use of machines to replace human power. Industrial operations that began in people's homes evolved into a big space capable of housing many machines, which we refer to as factories ([Gann, 2010](#); [Jeschke et al., 2017](#)). This initiative encourages professionals to build administrative skills that will assist firm managers in forecasting demand, securing raw resources, and using leadership principles to coordinate and supervise their subordinates' everyday tasks. From a public administration viewpoint, effective governance is the launching pad for public service delivery, requiring bureaucratic competence to establish and execute policies ([Mutula & Wamukoya, 2009](#)).

In an ideal world, the bureaucratic bureaucracy would plan and administer public policy independently of political interests. A nation, including Indonesia, that is committed to providing responsible, responsive, inclusive, effective and efficient public services that are transparent and adhere to the laws and welcomes all stakeholders to participate in their implementation ([Sheng, 2009](#)). However, in practise, bureaucrats are inextricably linked to political interests ([Haning, 2015](#); [Prasojo, 2020](#)). The objective of this research is to examine and reform the state in order to better public services from the progressive era's standpoint of bureaucracy, modernism, and postmodernity.

RESEARCH METHODS

The research approach utilised in producing this essay is a literature review method from numerous sources linked to bureaucracy, modernism and postmodernity viewpoints in the progressive age ([Kitchenham et al., 2009](#); [Pautasso, 2013](#)). This study is a descriptive qualitative research with the kind of library research (library research). Literature study is a sequence of actions connected to the ways of acquiring library data, reading, and taking notes and processing research materials ([Zed, 2014](#)). The study design was carried out via many phases, specifically as follows: first, tracing, recording, and reading various findings related to bureaucratic and policy discussions in the Covid-19 era in general in every discussion of research results, articles, and news obtained in the literature, and website sources for official government institutions ([Wu et al., 2020](#)).

As well as international institutions, as well as other sources relevant to this study. Second, combining all results, both theories, models and ideas of organisational change and transformation of public services ([Ostrom & Ostrom, 2019](#)). Third, assess each discovery from numerous readings, both in terms of benefits, downsides, and the relevancy of the texts presented. The final step is to give a critical evaluation by describing models and techniques that are distinct from the results in the preceding piece.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Bureaucratic Perspective

The term "bureaucracy" refers to a group of policymakers and administrators who are selected via non-elective methods, possess certain abilities, and execute government or public administration authority in accordance with constitutional laws and authority hierarchies ([Fountain, 2008](#); [Toma, 1982](#)). Bureaucracy is a critical tool of contemporary state public administration since it enables the implementation of numerous policies and programmes and the provision of public services through bureaucratic machinery ([Rosati, 1981](#)). Efficient Bureaucracy has significant significance due to its critical role in public affairs. According to Max Weber's bureaucratic theory, bureaucracy serves as the foundation for system building inside an organisation and is supposed to stress efficiency and economic effectiveness. It is a perfect model for its management and administration, since it serves as the focal point for the organization's power structure.

International organizations (IOs) are increasingly considered important actors in the realm of global governance. Many of the challenges countries face cut across state borders, and the growth of international organizations in number, resources and staff size reflects the trend to delegate tasks to these actors. In light of this development, researchers have started to look more closely inside international organizations, trying to understand how administrative structures, internal processes, available resources, staff composition as well as organizational cultures and styles define the work of IOs. The ultimate aim is to assess what impact international bureaucrats have on the way their organizations work and evolve over time. At the same time, it will enlarge the horizon of previous research perspectives by systematically considering the inter-linkages of internal administrative processes with external environments of IOs.

Acknowledging the multi-dimensional and multi-level nature of policy-making at international level, the panel will advance our knowledge on how international organizations' internal work is shaped by their place in the global system, and how internal dynamics may

shape global policy-making. The layout and style of bureaucracy are almost same around the globe, owing to a series of continual innovations in public administration. The bureaucracy's primary strength is its domain knowledge, which serves as a critical instrument for making public policy choices ([Nelson, 1987](#); [Siddiquee, 2008](#)). While the bureaucracy is an important component of the government system, it is sometimes seen as a danger to democracy. In emerging nations, bureaucracy exert power illegally with the backing of elected lawmakers and eventually constitute a danger to democracy ([Day, 2016](#); [Delaporte & Maurel, 2016](#)).

Occasionally, the bureaucracy abuses its authority, engages in corruption, and acts as a forgotten expert in the position of public servant. Thus, accountability and openness are public policies that the administration must adhere to in order to maintain control and oversight of the bureaucratic machinery. Good governance is a critical milestone in emphasising bureaucratic accountability and openness in order to guarantee that people get better services. The government decree is constantly being renewed. In Indonesia, the COVID-19 epidemic has altered the administrative hierarchy and labour patterns in the immediate government context ([Astley, 2019](#); [Pfiffner & Sherwood, 1965](#)). The work process has changed away from face-to-face interactions and towards remote labour (work from home).

Central and local government agencies make every effort to conduct service, administrative, and coordinating activities online. Adjustments are made to foster an adaptable work culture and a sense of integrity among state civil workers in order to boost their performance. Meanwhile, for the bureaucracy, the Ministry of Bureaucratic Empowerment and Reform (PANRB) No. 58/2020 regulates the mechanism for adjusting the work system for ASN employees in Indonesia. Specifically performing official duties in the office (work from office), specifically performing official duties in the office in accordance with applicable employment legislation; and secondly, performing official duties at home ([Antlöv et al., 2010](#); [Dwiyanto, 2013](#)).

In recent years, Indonesia has introduced reforms to its bureaucracy in response to critiques of the quality of government policy design and delivery. The Grand Design of Bureaucratic Reform strategy seeks to reduce the number of civil servants employed in administrative or managerial positions in favour of skills-based recruitment into 'functional' positions. Specifically, the introduction of the 'policy analyst' position as a functional position in the civil service has sought to improve evidence-based policy making and the quality of policy outcomes, by incorporating merit-based recruitment, appointment and promotion. The role of functional policy analysts (Jabatan Fungsional Analisis Kebijakan or JFAKs) is to assist policy makers in identifying policy issues, analyse evidence available on these issues, and ultimately make policy recommendations. This report overviews the recent experiences of different policy analyst cohorts since the role's creation in 2015. It investigates these experiences to better understand the extent to which policy analysts are playing the role intended for them, and the factors enabling or inhibiting this.

The bureaucracy must maintain hierarchical and inflexible processes in order to maintain a stable environment. Why has Indonesia been unable to address the country's strategic challenges? To begin, the Indonesian bureaucracy remains in the back row compared to other countries in terms of quickly and appropriately deciding policies in response to a world that continues to change and develop dynamically and rapidly, particularly in the fields of information, communication, and technology (ICT). Second, the public bureaucracy operates conceptually on the basis of rules, processes, hierarchies, and controls.

Modern Perspective

The advent of capitalism and strong rationality in the 20th century has marked the arrival of the modern period with the introduction of the idea of Total Quality Management ([Arditi & Gunaydin, 1997](#); [Hackman & Wageman, 1995](#)). It therefore diminishes social interactions between people and promotes non-personal characteristics ([Tari, 2005](#)). Humans are perceived depending on the strength of social structures and values that are inherent in each person. The behaviour of a person's lifestyle has dominated and rendered individuals passive in defining their conduct. That is what we call contemporary man. It is widely

acknowledged that 'modernity' refers to a strong collection of cultural, political, economic and geographical linkages that have profoundly impacted the structure of social, economic life, and the use and perception of time and place ([Kay & Marple, 1981](#)).

Common characteristics of this relationship include: an emphasis on rationality and science over tradition and myth; belief in progress and improvement; belief in human domination over nature; a focus on humanism, individuality, and self-awareness; close connection with the birth and development of market capitalism; and a strong dependence on the state and its legal and governmental institutions. Modernity is a historical process, progressive in its construction. Example, Existing neural ranking models follow the text matching paradigm, where document-to-query relevance is estimated through predicting the matching score. Drawing from the rich literature of classical generative retrieval models, we introduce and formalize the paradigm of deep generative retrieval models defined via the cumulative probabilities of generating query terms.

This paradigm offers a grounded probabilistic view on relevance estimation while still enabling the use of modern neural architectures. In contrast to the matching paradigm, the probabilistic nature of generative rankers readily offers a fine-grained measure of uncertainty. We adopt several current neural generative models in our framework and introduce a novel generative ranker (T-PGN), which combines the encoding capacity of Transformers with the Pointer Generator Network model. Conduct an extensive set of evaluation experiments on passage retrieval, leveraging the MS MARCO Passage Re-ranking and TREC Deep Learning 2019 Passage Re-ranking collections. Our results show the significantly higher performance of the T-PGN model when compared with other generative models. Lastly, we demonstrate that exploiting the uncertainty information of deep generative rankers opens new perspectives to query/collection understanding, and significantly improves the cut-off prediction tax.

Modern people are quite delighted to live with technical and scientific breakthroughs, but the conveniences supplied are also the greatest dread for humans since they will take over their work ([Kashdan et al., 2008](#)). The lack of self-security in the realm of work truly threatens unemployment and the absence of job for people. Indeed, dread and worry have become the condition of the contemporary human psyche today. This condition would indirectly drive people into a terrible melancholy, not only for regular people but also for policy leaders. So that psychologically, contemporary individuals include society, the state, even public institutions appear not equipped to confront the hazards of modernity. Of course, this will have an influence on government laws issued by a country's policy makers.

Modernity is best understood as a collection of connections that have been formed in a contextual and situational fashion and assume various effects via their power to affect change in frequently geographically divergent and varied situations ([Amilien & Hegnes, 2013](#)). Although sometimes challenged, the geographical reach of modernity is now essentially boundless. It has become a worldwide phenomena, and its effect on human culture and awareness has grown quite significant. However, as much as modernity is tightly related to order and development, the human experience of modernity may be unpleasant and unexpected. Thus, modernity is generally understood as a contradictory phenomenon, layered by complexity, contradiction, and variety. Modernity consequently becomes a strong and instrumental force, but a force that fluctuates between order and chaos, and is founded on a series of inconsistencies and paradoxes that are arguably symbolic of the very essence of human development.

Errors in the system are the things that are more usually encountered than the errors of employees. He added quality improvement would cut repair expenses. owing to lower repair costs, less mistakes, less delays, and better use of time and resources, higher productivity, increased market share due to enhanced quality and pricing, increased profitability of the firm so it can continue in operation, number of employment increased.

Postmodern Perspective

Postmodernism is a concept or phenomenon that arises as a result of modernism's limitations in explaining and describing the dynamics of contemporary society's life, which is

becoming increasingly diverse and complex, pluralistic, political fragmented, and distrustful of government and science, as well as incompatible discourse ([Brott, 2001](#); [Rossiter et al., 2005](#)). The postmodern approach, or what is often referred to as posmo, is a set of concepts that are out of step with contemporary life ([Hassan, 2015](#); [Ray, 1996](#)). These are esoteric and/or exclusive concepts, which implies they are only known to a select few. As a result of postmodernists' beliefs and ideas being unfamiliar to the majority of people's minds, they often contradict the values promoted by society. However, as the age progressed, the postmodern approach provided a breath of new air for a country to create its nation around its indigenous potential, since postmodern values it.

Given the essentials of the fundamental and humanist commonalities and the growth of these two ideas, some people argue that postmodernism is a part of modernity that, with a critical approach to some of its claims, has been somehow differently reproduced or restructured. Therefore, postmodernism, being a special prospect on the criticism, explanation, and extension of modernism and in contrast with modernism, negatively emphasizes on wholeness and meta-narratives and by doing so, it wants to create a balance in it and modifies the humanist moralities dominating the West in more moderate ways. This is in contrast to modernism's worldview, which is characterised by colonialism, the colonisation of culture and race, and a concerted effort towards westernisation. The postmodern worldview emphasises the importance of plurality or multiculturalism, as well as the importance of social and religious values and human rights.

As a result, numerous organisations embrace the postmodern worldview. This is because the postmodern viewpoint disregards the ideals represented in the postmodern perspective ([Hargreaves, 1994](#)). Essentially, postmodernism emerged as a reaction to the fact that the dreams aspired to in the modern era (modern perspective) were never realised, including the following: (a) modern technology reveals itself to be extremely dangerous and has an effect on the social field, as well as awareness of the increasingly damaged environment, due to its disregard for social, cultural, and religious values; (b) modern rationality is considered to have failed to fully address human neo-liberalism; and (c) postmodern These are the kind of events that precipitate the emergence of a postmodern viewpoint.

In addition to the debate above, postmodernism is concerned that contemporary society would progressively lose its autonomy of individuality, including the notion of identity. This erosion happens as a result of technological advancements. As such, it should be recognised that the idea of a contemporary viewpoint will inevitably have negative consequences that a government or nation must foresee. The state and government must be more proactive and innovative in order to produce things that serve society while also taking into consideration individual people's beliefs, pluralism, and numerous human rights. Because our civilisation is increasingly characterised by anxiety, dread, and worry. They fall into this category because the threats to their life and the degree of safety are not proportionate and connected. The most straightforward example is that individuals are fearful of losing their benefits and employment. Thus, it makes logical that anxiety levels rise when the nation or the globe is confronted with an economic crisis, as is the case now.

The emergence of the postmodern viewpoint, which emphasises the quest for the worth of justice for people and the state in opposition to the dynamics of communal life, has started to get more attention. One expression of the process of pursuing justice is an occurrence in the drive to include more than people in the formulation of policies and decisions affecting public and private enterprises. The more modern society becomes, the greater the necessity for individual community participation in decision-making processes by taking into account the numerous environmental values within which the person lives, so that individual individuals do not feel alienated from the plans and choices made.

CONCLUSION

The evolution of a more recent age has moved human conduct away from classical behaviour and towards contemporary people who value individuality and are at ease with

technological sophistication. This will reflect the nation's image in a country indirectly. The nation's character will also influence how public services are delivered. As a result, the service's slope must be levelled once again. According to bureaucratic theory, the bureaucracy's primary strength is its domain knowledge, which serves as a critical instrument for making public policy choices.

Meanwhile, according to current perspective theory, public services that emphasise the use of technology and defend the idea of individuality would exacerbate one's concerns and worry. It is distinct from the postmodern viewpoint theory; this idea has infused new life into a country by encouraging it to construct its nation around its inherent potential, as postmodern does. This postmodern paradigm is particularly well-suited for use in developing nations and countries with a high degree of pluralism.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

-

REFERENCE

- Ackermann, F., & Eden, C. (2011). Strategic Management of Stakeholders: Theory and Practice. *Long Range Planning*, 44(3), 179–196. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lrp.2010.08.001>
- Amilien, V., & Hegnes, A. W. (2013). The dimensions of 'traditional food' in reflexive modernity: Norway as a case study. *Journal of the Science of Food and Agriculture*, 93(14), 3455–3463. <https://doi.org/10.1002/jsfa.6318>
- Antlöv, H., Brinkerhoff, D. W., & Rapp, E. (2010). Civil Society Capacity Building for Democratic Reform: Experience and Lessons from Indonesia. *VOLUNTAS: International Journal of Voluntary and Nonprofit Organizations*, 21(3), 417–439. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11266-010-9140-x>
- Arditi, D., & Gunaydin, H. M. (1997). Total quality management in the construction process. *International Journal of Project Management*, 15(4), 235–243. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0263-7863\(96\)00076-2](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0263-7863(96)00076-2)
- Astley, W. G. (2019). Administrative Science As Socially Constructed Truth. In *Postmodern Management Theory* (pp. 3–19). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429431678-1>
- Bicalho, T., Sauer, I., Rambaud, A., & Altukhova, Y. (2017). LCA data quality: A management science perspective. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 156, 888–898. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2017.03.229>
- Brinkerhoff, D. W., & Brinkerhoff, J. M. (2015). Public Sector Management Reform in Developing Countries: Perspectives Beyond NPM Orthodoxy. *Public Administration and Development*, 35(4), 222–237. <https://doi.org/10.1002/pad.1739>
- Brott, P. E. (2001). The Storied Approach: A Postmodern Perspective for Career Counseling. *The Career Development Quarterly*, 49(4), 304–313. <https://doi.org/10.1002/j.2161-0045.2001.tb00958.x>
- Crew, M. A., & Kleindorfer, P. R. (1999). Stranded Assets in Network Industries in Transition. *Regulation Under Increasing Competition*, 63–78. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4615-5117-1_4
- Davis, G. F. (2015). Editorial Essay: What Is Organizational Research For? *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 60(2), 179–188. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0001839215585725>
- Day, D. (2016). Citizen Participation in the Planning Process: An Essentially Contested Concept? *Journal of Planning Literature*, 11(3), 421–434. <https://doi.org/10.1177/088541229701100309>
- Delaporte, I., & Maurel, M. (2016). Adaptation to climate change in Bangladesh. *Climate Policy*, 18(1), 49–62. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14693062.2016.1222261>
- Dwiyanto, A. (2013). *Mengembalikan kepercayaan publik melalui reformasi birokrasi*. Gramedia Pustaka Utama.

- Evans, D., & Yen, D. C. (2005). E-government: An analysis for implementation: Framework for understanding cultural and social impact. *Government Information Quarterly*, 22(3), 354–373. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.giq.2005.05.007>
- Fountain, J. E. (2008). Bureaucratic reform and e-government in the United States: An institutional perspective. In *Routledge Handbook of Internet Politics* (pp. 115–129). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203962541-15>
- Gann, D. M. (2010). Construction as a manufacturing process? Similarities and differences between industrialized housing and car production in Japan. *Construction Management and Economics*, 14(5), 437–450. <https://doi.org/10.1080/014461996373304>
- Hackman, J. R., & Wageman, R. (1995). Total Quality Management: Empirical, Conceptual, and Practical Issues. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 40(2), 309. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2393640>
- Hamilton, G. G., & Biggart, N. W. (2015). Market, Culture, and Authority: A Comparative Analysis of Management and Organization in the Far East. *Sociological Analysis of Economic Institutions*, 94(1), S52–S94. <https://doi.org/10.1086/228942>
- Haning, M. T. (2015). *Reformasi Birokrasi Desain Organisasi Yang Mendukung Pelayanan Publik Di Indonesia*. Ilmu Giri.
- Hargreaves, A. (1994). *Development and Desire: A Postmodern Perspective*. ERIC. <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ed372057>
- Hassan, I. (2015). Pluralism in Postmodern Perspective. *The University of Chicago Press Journals*, 12(3), 503–520. <https://doi.org/10.1086/448348>
- Jeschke, S., Brecher, C., Meisen, T., Özdemir, D., & Eschert, T. (2017). Industrial Internet of Things and Cyber Manufacturing Systems. *Industrial Internet of Things*, 10(1), 3–19. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-42559-7_1
- Kashdan, T. B., Biswas-Diener, R., & King, L. A. (2008). Reconsidering happiness: the costs of distinguishing between hedonics and eudaimonia. *The Journal of Positive Psychology*, 3(4), 219–233. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17439760802303044>
- Kay, S. M., & Marple, S. L. (1981). Spectrum Analysis—A Modern Perspective. *Proceedings of the IEEE*, 69(11), 1380–1419. <https://doi.org/10.1109/proc.1981.12184>
- Kitchenham, B., Pearl Brereton, O., Budgen, D., Turner, M., Bailey, J., & Linkman, S. (2009). Systematic literature reviews in software engineering - A systematic literature review. In *Information and Software Technology* (Vol. 51, Issue 1, pp. 7–15). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.infsof.2008.09.009>
- Mutula, S., & Wamukoya, J. M. (2009). Public sector information management in east and southern Africa: Implications for FOI, democracy and integrity in government. *International Journal of Information Management*, 29(5), 333–341. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijinfomgt.2009.04.004>
- Nelson, R. H. (1987). The Economics Profession and the Making of Public Policy. *Journal of Economic Literature*, 25(1), 49–50. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/2726190>
- Olivia, S., Gibson, J., & Nasrudin, R. (2020). Indonesia in the Time of Covid- 19. *Bulletin of Indonesian Economic Studies*, 56(2), 143–174.
- Ostrom, V., & Ostrom, E. (2019). Public goods and public choices. In *Alternatives for Delivering Public Services: Toward Improved Performance*. Taylor and Francis. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429047978-2>
- Pautasso, M. (2013). Ten simple rules for writing a literature review. *PLoS Computational Biology*, 9(7), 5.
- Pfiffner, J. M., & Sherwood, F. P. (1965). *Administrative organization* (5th ed.). Prentice-Hall.
- Prasojo, E. (2020). *Memimpin reformasi birokrasi: Kompleksitas dan dinamika perubahan Birokrasi*. Prenada Media.
- Ray, R. E. (1996). A Postmodern Perspective on Feminist Gerontology. *The Gerontologist*, 36(5), 674–680. <https://doi.org/10.1093/geront/36.5.674>

- Rosati, J. A. (1981). Developing a Systematic Decision-Making Framework: Bureaucratic Politics in Perspective. *World Politics*, 33(2), 234–252. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2010371>
- Rossiter, A., Prilleltensky, I., & Walsh-Bowers, R. (2005). A postmodern perspective on professional ethics. In *Practice and Research in Social Work: Postmodern Feminist Perspectives* (pp. 84–104). Taylor and Francis. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203981979-12>
- Rüland, J. (2021). Covid-19 and ASEAN: Strengthening State-centrism, Eroding Inclusiveness, Testing Cohesion. *The International Spectator*, 56(2), 72–92. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03932729.2021.1893058>
- Santagata, W. (2006). Cultural Districts and Their Role in Developed and Developing Countries. *Handbook of the Economics of Art and Culture*, 1, 1101–1119. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S1574-0676\(06\)01031-3](https://doi.org/10.1016/S1574-0676(06)01031-3)
- Sergi, B. S., Popkova, E. G., Bogoviz, A. v., & Ragulina, J. v. (2019). Entrepreneurship and economic growth: The experience of developed and developing countries. *Entrepreneurship and Development in the 21st Century*, 3–32. <https://doi.org/10.1108/978-1-78973-233-720191002/full/xml>
- Sheng, Y. K. (2009). *What is Good Governance?* United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific.
- Sheth, J. (2020). Impact of Covid-19 on consumer behavior: Will the old habits return or die? *Journal of Business Research*, 117, 280–283. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2020.05.059>
- Siddiquee, N. A. (2008). Bureaucratic accountability in Bangladesh: Challenges and limitations. *Asian Journal of Political Science*, 7(2), 88–104. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02185379908434149>
- Song, J., & Shin, J. (2008). The paradox of technological capabilities: a study of knowledge sourcing from host countries of overseas R&D operations. *Journal of International Business Studies* 2008 39:2, 39(2), 291–303. <https://doi.org/10.1057/palgrave.jibs.8400348>
- Susilawati, S., Falefi, R., & Purwoko, A. (2020). Impact of COVID-19's Pandemic on the Economy of Indonesia. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute (BIRCI-Journal): Humanities and Social Sciences*, 3(2), 1147–1156. <https://doi.org/10.33258/birci.v3i2.954>
- Tarí, J. J. (2005). Components of successful total quality management. *TQM Magazine*, 17(2), 182–194. <https://doi.org/10.1108/09544780510583245/full/xml>
- Toma, M. (1982). Inflationary bias of the Federal Reserve System: A bureaucratic perspective. *Journal of Monetary Economics*, 10(2), 163–190. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0304-3932\(82\)90013-7](https://doi.org/10.1016/0304-3932(82)90013-7)
- Weber, M. (1947). *The theory of social and economic organization* (T. Parsons, Ed.). Oxford University Press.
- Wu, Y. C., Chen, C. S., & Chan, Y. J. (2020). The outbreak of COVID-19: An overview. *Journal of the Chinese Medical Association*, 83(3), 217–220. <https://doi.org/10.1097/jcma.0000000000000270>
- Wunder, S., Engel, S., & Pagiola, S. (2008). Taking stock: A comparative analysis of payments for environmental services programs in developed and developing countries. *Ecological Economics*, 65(4), 834–852. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolecon.2008.03.010>
- Zed, M. (2014). *Metode penelitian kepustakaan* (3rd ed.). Yayasan Obor Indonesia.