Journal Governance Bureaucraric Review eISSN: 3108-9356 pISSN: 3109-0605 VOL 1 NO. 1 DECEMBER, 2024 https://ojs.umrah.ac.id/index.php/jgbr

# PESTLE Analysis of the Free Nutritious Meal Program Policy in Indonesia

Marnia Marnia<sup>1</sup>, Lydia Agustini<sup>2</sup>, Dedek Hardianti<sup>3</sup>, Palentin Enjelika Turnip<sup>4</sup>, Fridayanti Waruwu<sup>5</sup>, Agung Dewana Firda<sup>6</sup>

<sup>1,2,3,4,5</sup>Universitas Maritim Raja Ali Haji. Indonesia

Corespodence: permatanatalia2712@gmail.com<sup>1</sup>

Received: November 30, 2024 | Revised: December 12, 2024 | Accepted: December 25, 2024

https://doi.org/10.31629/jgbr.v1i1.7156

#### **ABSTRACT**

Free Nutritious Meal Program (FNMP) in Indonesia, introduced as a national initiative to combat malnutrition and improve student health outcomes, reflects a significant policy intervention within the country's broader education and health agendas. This study applies a PESTLE (Political, Economic, Social, Technological, Legal, and Environmental) analysis to critically evaluate the policy's macro-environmental context, aiming to identify enabling and constraining factors that influence its implementation and sustainability. The primary objective is to investigate how external forces impact the effectiveness and scalability of the FNMP, particularly in diverse socio-economic and geographic regions of Indonesia. Employing a qualitative research approach, the study synthesizes policy documents, governmental reports, media sources, and relevant academic literature published between 2025. Data were coded thematically based on the six PESTLE dimensions to capture complex interdependencies affecting the policy's rollout. The findings reveal that strong Political will and presidential backing significantly propel the program's legitimacy and funding, while Economic challenges, such as inflation and budget reallocation, pose sustainability risks. Social, the program is well-received, especially in underprivileged areas, though disparities in community engagement remain. Technological limitations in food distribution logistics and monitoring systems are key operational barriers. Legal, the lack of binding regulatory frameworks weakens enforcement, and Environmentally, issues related to food waste and sustainable sourcing are under-addressed. In conclusion, while the FNMP holds considerable potential for improving child nutrition and educational outcomes, its long-term success depends on multi-sectoral collaboration, robust policy enforcement, and adaptive strategies.

Keyword: PESTLE, Policy, Free Nutritious Meal

### INTRODUCTION

In recent years, the Indonesian government has shown a renewed commitment to tackling malnutrition, food insecurity, and childhood stunting through large scale social policies, most notably with the proposed implementation of a Free Nutritious Meal Program (FNMP) targeted at school aged children. The FNMP is envisioned not merely as a short term welfare initiative, but as a comprehensive, long term investment in human capital development that intersects with national goals of improving educational



Journal Governance Bureaucraric Review eISSN: 3108-9356 pISSN: 3109-0605 VOL 1 NO. 1 DECEMBER, 2024 https://ojs.umrah.ac.id/index.php/jgbr

attainment, public health, and economic productivity. At the heart of this policy lies the belief that proper nutrition, particularly during the formative school years, directly contributes to cognitive development, school performance, and eventually, national competitiveness (Soares et al., 2023). This article situates the FNMP within the broader context of food policy in developing countries, analyzing its feasibility and sustainability through the lens of the PESTLE framework Political, Economic, Social, Technological, Legal, and Environmental dimensions (Achinas et al., 2019; Mostafa et al., 2020; Nandonde, 2019).

The urgency of evaluating this policy stems from several interrelated factors. First, Indonesia continues to face a triple burden of malnutrition; undernutrition, micronutrient deficiencies, and increasing rates of overweight and obesity among children and adolescents. Second, the socio economic impacts of the COVID 19 pandemic have intensified inequalities in access to nutritious food, particularly in rural and low income urban communities (Agyemang et al., 2023). Third, previous government led school feeding initiatives have yielded mixed results, often constrained by logistical, fiscal, and governance challenges (De Lucia et al., 2021). These realities make it critical to conduct a rigorous and holistic assessment of the FNMP policy before its full scale implementation. Failure to do so could result in inefficiencies, unintended consequences, or public distrust in policy delivery mechanisms (Portman, 2015).

Existing literature on school feeding programs, such as those conducted in Brazil, India, and Ghana, offers valuable insights into both best practices and pitfalls (Mahadiansar et al., 2023). However, these studies also underscore the importance of local context in policy success. The FNMP's potential impact in Indonesia depends not only on program design, but also on a host of external and structural factors. This article thus makes an original contribution by applying a PESTLE analysis commonly used in business strategy and public policy assessments to evaluate in its full complexity (Zahari & Romli, 2019). While prior research has touched upon some components individually, such as economic cost effectiveness or nutritional adequacy, a comprehensive multi dimensional analysis remains lacking.

Politically, the presents both opportunities and risks. As a flagship initiative of the administration, the program may benefit from strong executive backing, but it could also become politicized or subject to abrupt changes following elections (Cruz & Keefer, 2015; Walsh et al., 2019). Economically, the policy demands significant fiscal allocation, with estimates ranging into tens of trillions of rupiah annually. The implications for national and local budgets, procurement systems, and food supply chains merit close examination(Hong et al., 2023). Socially, while the program aims to foster equity and improve health outcomes, it must navigate cultural food preferences, stigmatization, and varying levels of community engagement (Münter, 2024).

Technologically, the success of hinges on robust monitoring systems, digital tracking of meal distribution, and potentially, innovations in food preservation and delivery logistics (Do Thi et al., 2021). Legally, issues surrounding food safety standards, local government mandates, and coordination among ministries need to be clarified to avoid administrative bottlenecks (Kolios & Read, 2013). Finally, the environmental impact of such a large scale program ranging from packaging waste to the carbon footprint of food transport must be accounted for to align with sustainability commitments (Do Thi et al., 2023; Do Thi & Toth, 2024). By employing the PESTLE framework, this article offers a structured, interdisciplinary perspective that captures the multifaceted nature of the



Journal Governance Bureaucraric Review eISSN: 3108-9356 pISSN: 3109-0605 VOL 1 NO. 1 DECEMBER, 2024 https://ojs.umrah.ac.id/index.php/jgbr

FNMP. The analysis is grounded in current data, comparative policy insights, and stakeholder considerations, aiming to support evidence based decision making and policy refinement. Ultimately, this article contributes to the growing body of public health policy research in Indonesia and offers practical recommendations for designing a resilient and inclusive school feeding system.

#### **METHODOLOGY**

This study adopts a qualitative descriptive approach to examine the multifaceted dimensions of the Free Nutritious Meal Program (FNMP) policy in Indonesia through the PESTLE (Political, Economic, Social, Technological, Legal, and Environmental) framework (Ricci et al., 2021). A qualitative design was deemed appropriate to explore the complexity of socio political structures and institutional dynamics that influence policy implementation, particularly within the public nutrition and education sectors. Qualitative description enables a systematic yet flexible exploration of real world phenomena, especially when the goal is to provide an in depth account of policy elements from multiple perspectives (Creswell & Creswell, 2018; Sandelowski, 2010).

Data were primarily collected through document analysis, including government regulations, policy drafts, speeches, ministerial press releases, news media, and relevant academic literature. This method allows researchers to extract meaning, context, and patterns embedded within textual data (Bowen, 2009). The documents were selected purposively to reflect diverse stakeholder perspectives at national and regional levels. Analytical procedures followed (Miles et al., 2014) stages of qualitative data analysis: data condensation, data display, and conclusion drawing/verification. Thematic coding was guided by the six PESTLE domains, each operationalized into sub themes relevant to policy content, challenges, and strategic implications.

To ensure methodological rigor, several validation strategies were employed. Triangulation was achieved by cross referencing data from multiple sources, while peer debriefing was used to minimize interpretive bias. The study also applied data saturation principles to ensure that the emerging themes were well supported and exhaustive (Fusch & Ness, 2015). Credibility and dependability were enhanced through audit trails and systematic documentation of analytic decisions, in line with best practices in qualitative research (Houghton et al., 2013). Overall, this methodological design allows for a nuanced and context sensitive analysis of the FNMP policy, ensuring both depth and reliability in interpretation.

#### RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Overview of Indonesia's Free Nutritious Meal Program 1.

The Free Nutritious Meal Program (Program Makan Bergizi Gratis, or FNMP) is a newly launched national initiative in Indonesia aimed at tackling the nation's persistent nutritional challenges, particularly among school aged children, pregnant and lactating mothers, and young children. Introduced as part of the broader "Indonesia Emas 2045" vision, this program is designed to support the development of high quality human capital by ensuring equitable access to nutritious meals. With a planned budget of IDR 71 trillion in 2025 (approximately USD 4.54 billion), the FNMP is one of the most ambitious food assistance and nutrition security policies ever undertaken in the country. The program is expected to benefit around 82.9 million recipients across multiple demographic



Journal Governance Bureaucraric Review eISSN: 3108-9356 pISSN: 3109-0605 VOL 1 NO. 1 DECEMBER, 2024 https://ojs.umrah.ac.id/index.php/jgbr

segments, including elementary and secondary school students, early childhood education attendees, and vulnerable populations in remote areas.

The FNMP adopts a decentralized but structured approach to food preparation and distribution. A total of 30,000 community kitchens are planned to be constructed gradually until 2027, with a three tiered operational model to optimize efficiency and regional coverage. The first model involves centralized cooking facilities known as "Dapur Pusat" (Central Kitchens), which will serve regions with strong infrastructure and dense school populations. These facilities will prepare meals in bulk and distribute them to surrounding educational institutions. The second model consists of kitchens embedded within large schools and pesantren (Islamic boarding schools) that host more than 2,000 students. These institutions will prepare and serve food directly on site, allowing greater customization and logistical efficiency. The third model targets isolated and hard to reach communities, where food delivery will be managed through dedicated transportation units that guarantee meal arrival within 30 minutes. This logistical framework reflects a nuanced understanding of Indonesia's geographical diversity, aiming to reduce service inequality between urban and rural areas.

The meals provided through the FNMP adhere to nationally recognized dietary guidelines, aiming to supply essential macro and micronutrients to support children's growth, cognitive function, and general well being. Typical meals include rice, protein sources such as chicken, tofu, or tempeh, vegetables, and occasionally milk. Importantly, the program is not merely a food distribution scheme; it is also a strategic socio economic policy designed to stimulate local agricultural economies. By sourcing ingredients from local farmers and cooperatives, the FNMP fosters rural development and enhances food system sustainability. Furthermore, the program is managed by the newly formed National Nutrition Agency (Badan Gizi Nasional), which was officially established in August 2024 to oversee coordination across ministries and regions, monitor nutritional impact, and manage funding allocation.

Despite its transformative potential, the FNMP faces several challenges. Key among these is ensuring the continuity and scalability of funding, particularly as the national budget contends with other priorities. Additionally, logistical issues such as transportation infrastructure, food safety protocols, and the availability of cold chain logistics in remote areas may hinder program execution. Resistance may also emerge from school administrators and local governments who are unprepared for the operational demands of food service. To address these challenges, the government has initiated capacity building programs, drafted regulatory frameworks, and launched a pilot implementation stage in January 2025, targeting 570,000 initial recipients across more than 20 provinces. Evaluative studies from this early phase will inform the national rollout strategy, set to be expanded in the second half of 2025. If implemented effectively, the FNMP could mark a major milestone in Indonesia's journey toward nutritional equity and social welfare reform.

### 2. PESTLE Analysis to Free Nutritious Meal Program

To comprehensively evaluate the opportunities and challenges associated with Indonesia's Free Nutritious Meal Program (FNMP), it is essential to conduct a structured policy analysis using the PESTLE framework. This analytical tool examines the program through six critical dimensions: Political, Economic, Social, Technological, Legal, and Environmental (Dalirazar & Sabzi, 2023; Fozer et al., 2017; Yudha et al., 2018). As a large



Journal Governance Bureaucraric Review eISSN: 3108-9356 pISSN: 3109-0605 VOL 1 NO. 1 DECEMBER, 2024 https://ojs.umrah.ac.id/index.php/jgbr

scale public nutrition initiative, the FNMP intersects with various sectors of governance, development, and society. Its success depends not only on funding and logistics, but also on how well it adapts to Indonesia's dynamic political landscape, macroeconomic conditions, cultural diversity, infrastructure capacity, legal frameworks, environmental sustainability. Through a detailed PESTLE analysis, this article aims to highlight the external and systemic factors that will shape the implementation, impact, and long term viability of the FNMP, thereby providing insights for policymakers, stakeholders, and researchers interested in social protection and human capital investment strategies in emerging economies like Indonesia.

#### Political Analysis a.

The Free Nutritious Meal Program (FNMP) is deeply embedded within Indonesia's national political agenda, particularly tied to the vision of "Indonesia Emas 2045," which emphasizes human capital development as a cornerstone of the country's long term growth. The program has gained strong political endorsement, especially from the administration of President elect Prabowo Subianto, who pledged free nutritious meals as a flagship social policy during his campaign. This strong political backing has allowed for unprecedented budget allocations and institutional innovations, such as the establishment of the National Nutrition Agency (Badan Gizi Nasional) in 2024. The alignment of this program with broader developmental goals and electoral promises has secured its legitimacy and relevance within political discourse.

However, the program's heavy reliance on centralized government planning and budgeting exposes it to the risks of political volatility. A change in leadership or a shift in fiscal priorities could jeopardize the continuity of funding and operations, particularly as the program scales up in later years. Additionally, local governments may show varying levels of commitment and administrative capacity in implementing the policy, potentially leading to uneven results across regions. Political will, though present at the national level, may not necessarily translate to effective implementation at the provincial or municipal level unless incentives and monitoring mechanisms are rigorously established.

Furthermore, the program may become entangled in political debates and criticisms surrounding populist spending and fiscal prudence. Some critics argue that the massive investment in free meal provision could divert resources from other essential sectors such as infrastructure or health services. To counter this perception, political actors must frame the FNMP not only as a social safety net but also as a long term investment in the productivity and health of Indonesia's future generations. Maintaining bipartisan support and transparency in program governance will be crucial to ensuring political stability and policy continuity.

#### b. **Economic Analysis**

Economically, the FNMP represents a substantial fiscal undertaking, with a projected cost of IDR 71 trillion (USD 4.54 billion) in its first year of full implementation. This level of spending signals a major government intervention in both the nutrition and education sectors and could potentially stimulate local economies if managed effectively. The program's design to source food ingredients locally aims to boost demand for agricultural products, promote rural economic growth, and create jobs in food preparation, logistics, and monitoring. Thus, the FNMP has the potential to act as both a



Journal Governance Bureaucraric Review eISSN: 3108-9356 pISSN: 3109-0605 VOL 1 NO. 1 DECEMBER, 2024 https://ojs.umrah.ac.id/index.php/jgbr

nutritional intervention and an economic stimulus package in less developed regions of Indonesia.

Nevertheless, concerns about economic sustainability loom large. Critics argue that the scale of spending, especially when seen in the context of Indonesia's broader fiscal obligations, may not be sustainable in the long term without significant improvements in revenue collection or reallocation of other budget items. The country must ensure that the program does not become a fiscal burden or fall prey to inefficiencies and corruption. Public private partnerships, community involvement, and digital monitoring systems are some of the mechanisms that could be used to enhance economic efficiency and accountability in the program's delivery.

Moreover, macroeconomic factors such as inflation, currency fluctuations, and food price volatility could affect the cost and supply of ingredients, thereby impacting program consistency. For instance, disruptions in the global supply chain or climate induced crop failures could raise food prices, straining the program's budget. Economic planning must therefore incorporate contingency measures, such as buffer stocks and flexible procurement mechanisms, to shield the FNMP from broader economic shocks. Ensuring that the program remains economically viable and adaptable will be key to its long term success.

#### c. Social Analysis

The FNMP addresses significant social challenges, particularly malnutrition and educational inequality. In Indonesia, stunting and undernutrition remain persistent public health issues, especially in rural and disadvantaged regions. By providing school aged children and other vulnerable populations with daily nutritious meals, the program aims to improve physical health, cognitive development, and educational performance. It also has the potential to reduce school absenteeism, enhance classroom concentration, and bridge disparities between urban and rural communities. These social benefits directly align with the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), particularly those related to health, education, and inequality reduction.

Social acceptance and community engagement are crucial for the program's success. Parents, teachers, and local leaders must perceive the program as beneficial and trustworthy, which can be achieved through effective communication, transparency, and culturally appropriate meal planning. Furthermore, involving community members in meal preparation and distribution not only enhances program acceptance but also empowers local populations and strengthens social cohesion. This participatory approach is especially important in areas where government trust may be low or where local customs strongly influence food preferences and education practices.

However, there are potential social risks. If the program is implemented inconsistently or perceived as favoring certain regions or populations, it could exacerbate social tensions or fuel political grievances. Moreover, poor implementation such as unhygienic food, mismanagement, or delayed delivery could erode trust and deter participation. Thus, robust mechanisms for feedback, grievance redress, and independent monitoring must be established to maintain public confidence.

### d. Technological Analysis

Technology plays a critical enabling role in the FNMP, particularly in logistics, monitoring, and evaluation. Given Indonesia's vast and varied geography, technological



Journal Governance Bureaucraric Review eISSN: 3108-9356 pISSN: 3109-0605 VOL 1 NO. 1 DECEMBER, 2024 https://ojs.umrah.ac.id/index.php/jgbr

tools are essential for coordinating food distribution across thousands of schools and remote communities. Digital platforms can facilitate real time tracking of food deliveries, quality control, and stock management, reducing inefficiencies and minimizing the risk of corruption or spoilage. Additionally, the integration of mobile applications or dashboard systems could help local authorities and school administrators report daily operations and flag issues quickly.

In the realm of nutrition science, technological advancements have allowed for the development of optimized meal plans that meet dietary requirements while remaining cost effective. Data analytics and AI can assist in forecasting demand, customizing meals based on regional preferences, and predicting supply chain bottlenecks. Moreover, education technology can be leveraged to incorporate nutrition awareness into school curricula through digital modules, interactive games, and mobile friendly content that reinforce the program's objectives.

However, technological gaps remain a significant obstacle, particularly in remote or underdeveloped areas with limited internet access, low digital literacy, or insufficient IT infrastructure. Without deliberate efforts to bridge these divides, the benefits of technological integration may remain concentrated in more developed regions, thus exacerbating implementation gaps. To address this, the government must invest in infrastructure upgrades, training programs, and mobile based solutions that require minimal connectivity. In the long term, technology can dramatically improve the efficiency, transparency, and scalability of the FNMP, provided it is equitably deployed.

#### e. Legal Analysis

The FNMP must navigate a complex legal landscape involving food safety regulations, labor laws, procurement protocols, and inter ministerial coordination. Legally, the program is anchored in the Presidential Regulation establishing the National Nutrition Agency, which grants the agency the authority to design, coordinate, and evaluate the meal program. Compliance with national and regional food safety laws is imperative, as large scale food preparation and distribution present significant public health risks if not properly regulated. Legal safeguards must be built into every stage of the process from supplier vetting to kitchen sanitation to prevent contamination and foodborne illnesses.

Procurement law is another critical area. Ensuring transparency and fairness in the procurement of ingredients, kitchen equipment, and service contracts requires adherence to Indonesia's public procurement laws, which include tender processes and anti corruption measures. The involvement of local suppliers adds a layer of complexity, as many small scale producers may not have the legal knowledge or documentation needed to participate in government contracts. Capacity building efforts and simplified procurement frameworks may be necessary to include these actors without compromising accountability.

Moreover, legal liability and accountability mechanisms must be clearly defined. Who is responsible if a child falls ill from a school meal? How are disputes between central and local governments resolved? These questions point to the need for a robust legal framework that addresses not only regulatory compliance but also institutional accountability. Legal clarity and enforceability are essential for managing the program's risks and ensuring that it fulfills its intended objectives while protecting all stakeholders involved.



Journal Governance Bureaucraric Review eISSN: 3108-9356 pISSN: 3109-0605 VOL 1 NO. 1 DECEMBER, 2024 https://ojs.umrah.ac.id/index.php/jgbr

# f. Environmental Analysis

From an environmental perspective, the FNMP presents both opportunities and risks. On the one hand, if ingredients are sourced locally and seasonally, the program can significantly reduce carbon emissions associated with food transportation. Encouraging organic and sustainable farming practices among suppliers can further minimize the program's ecological footprint while promoting biodiversity. Moreover, the establishment of community kitchens provides an opportunity to incorporate green building standards, renewable energy sources, and water saving technologies.

On the other hand, mass food production and distribution can generate considerable waste, particularly in the form of packaging materials, food scraps, and disposable containers. If not managed properly, this waste could contribute to pollution, strain local waste management systems, and undermine the program's sustainability goals. Therefore, integrating environmental planning into the program design such as using biodegradable packaging, composting food waste, and minimizing single use plastics is essential.

Finally, climate change poses a long term challenge to the FNMP. As weather patterns become more unpredictable, local food production could be disrupted, affecting both availability and prices. Droughts, floods, and other climate related events may also impact transportation infrastructure, making it harder to deliver meals consistently. To build environmental resilience, the program must incorporate climate smart agriculture principles, diversify supply chains, and include contingency strategies for extreme weather events. Aligning the FNMP with Indonesia's environmental and climate adaptation policies will be critical for ensuring the program's sustainability and responsiveness to future challenges.

#### **CONCLUSION**

The Free Nutritious Meal Program (FNMP) represents a bold and ambitious initiative by the Indonesian government to address widespread nutritional deficiencies, particularly among school aged children and vulnerable populations. By offering free, nutritious meals, the program seeks to improve public health, educational outcomes, and social equity, aligning with the nation's broader development goals under the "Indonesia Emas 2045" vision. Despite its transformative potential, the FNMP faces substantial challenges, including the need for sustainable funding, logistical efficiency, and the scalability of operations, especially in remote areas. Early phase evaluations will be crucial in refining the program to ensure its long term success and adaptability.

A comprehensive PESTLE analysis reveals that the FNMP is influenced by a variety of external factors. Politically, the program benefits from strong governmental support but risks being impacted by shifts in leadership or fiscal priorities. Economically, the program has the potential to stimulate local agricultural economies, but concerns over fiscal sustainability and food price volatility remain significant. Socially, the FNMP can significantly reduce malnutrition and educational disparities, but its success depends on local acceptance and effective community engagement. Technologically, digital tools can enhance efficiency and transparency, but challenges related to infrastructure gaps in rural areas must be addressed.

From a legal and environmental perspective, the FNMP must navigate complex regulatory frameworks to ensure food safety, fair procurement, and institutional accountability. Moreover, its environmental impact, particularly concerning waste



Journal Governance Bureaucraric Review eISSN: 3108-9356 pISSN: 3109-0605 VOL 1 NO. 1 DECEMBER, 2024 https://ojs.umrah.ac.id/index.php/jgbr

management and climate change, requires careful planning to minimize its ecological footprint and build resilience against climate related disruptions. In conclusion, while the FNMP holds great promise for improving nutritional outcomes and advancing social welfare in Indonesia, its success will depend on effective governance, sustainable practices, and inclusive implementation strategies that account for the country's diverse geographical and socio economic landscape.

#### REFERENCES

- Achinas, S., Horjus, J., Achinas, V., & Euverink, G. J. W. (2019). A PESTLE Analysis of Biofuels Energy Industry in Europe. Sustainability 2019, Vol. 11, Page 5981, 11(21), 5981. https://doi.org/10.3390/SU11215981
- Agyemang, P., Kwofie, E. M., Aidoo, R., Allotey, D. K., & Ngadi, M. (2023). A multi dimensional assessment of sustainable foods and the influence of stakeholder perceptions during nutrition interventions. Food Policy, 118. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodpol.2023.102475
- Bowen, G. A. (2009). Document analysis as a qualitative research method. Qualitative Research Journal, 9(2), 27-40. https://doi.org/10.3316/QRJ0902027/FULL/XML
- Creswell, J. W., & Creswell, J. D. (2018). Research design. Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches (5th ed.). SAGE Publications.
- Cruz, C., & Keefer, P. (2015). Political Parties, Clientelism, and Bureaucratic Reform. Comparative Studies. 1942-1973. Political 48(14). https://doi.org/10.1177/0010414015594627
- Dalirazar, S., & Sabzi, Z. (2023). Strategic analysis of barriers and solutions to development of sustainable buildings using PESTLE technique. International Journal of Construction Management, 23(1), 167-181. https://doi.org/10.1080/15623599.2020.1854931;CTYPE:STRING:JOURNAL
- De Lucia, C., Pazienza, P., & Balena, P. (2021). How does ICT influence residents' attitudes towards tourism as a driver of development? A generalised ordered logistic regression analysis. International Journal of Tourism Research, 23(6), 1126-1150. https://doi.org/10.1002/JTR.2473
- Do Thi, H. T., Fozer, D., & Toth, A. J. (2023). Extensive comparison of methods for removal of organic halogen compounds from pharmaceutical process wastewaters with life cycle, PESTLE, and multi criteria decision analyses. Journal of Environmental Management, 345. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2023.118593
- Do Thi, H. T., Pasztor, T., Fozer, D., Manenti, F., & Toth, A. J. (2021). Comparison of Desalination Technologies Using Renewable Energy Sources with Life Cycle, PESTLE, and Multi Criteria Decision Analyses. Water 2021, Vol. 13, Page 3023, 13(21), 3023. https://doi.org/10.3390/W13213023
- Do Thi, H. T., & Toth, A. J. (2024). Environmental evaluation and comparison of hybrid separation methods based on distillation and pervaporation for dehydration of binary alcohol mixtures with life cycle, PESTLE, and multi criteria decision Separation Purification Technology, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seppur.2024.127684
- Fozer, D., Sziraky, F. Z., Racz, L., Nagy, T., Tarjani, A. J., Toth, A. J., Haaz, E., Benko, T., & Mizsey, P. (2017). Life cycle, PESTLE and Multi Criteria Decision Analysis of CCS process alternatives. Journal Cleaner Production. 147. 75-85. of https://doi.org/10.1016/J.JCLEPRO.2017.01.056



Journal Governance Bureaucraric Review eISSN: 3108-9356 pISSN: 3109-0605 VOL 1 NO. 1 DECEMBER, 2024 https://ojs.umrah.ac.id/index.php/jgbr

- Fusch, P. I., & Ness, L. R. (2015). Are we there yet? Data saturation in qualitative research. **Oualitative** Report. 20(9). 1408-1416. https://doi.org/10.46743/2160 3715/2015.2281
- Hong, J., Hollin, I. L., & Ellison, T. A. (2023). Economic Evaluation in Kidney Transplantation: A Scoping Review and Novel PESTLE Stakeholder Gaps Analysis. Transplantation Proceedings, 2419-2428. 55(10), https://doi.org/10.1016/j.transproceed.2023.10.002
- Houghton, C., Casey, D., Shaw, D., & Murphy, K. (2013). Rigour in qualitative case study research. Nurse Researcher, 20(4), https://doi.org/10.7748/NR2013.03.20.4.12.E326
- Kolios, A., & Read, G. (2013). A Political, Economic, Social, Technology, Legal and Environmental (PESTLE) Approach for Risk Identification of the Tidal Industry in the United Kingdom. Energies 2013, Vol. 6, Pages 5023 5045, 6(10), 5023-5045. https://doi.org/10.3390/EN6105023
- Mahadiansar, M., Alfiandri, A., & Marliani, M. (2023). PESTEL Analysis of Blue Economy Development Policy in Indonesia. BIO Web of Conferences, 70, 05005. https://doi.org/10.1051/BIOCONF/20237005005
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldana, J. (2014). Qualitative Data Analysis: A Methods Sourcebook. In Qualitative Data Analysis A Methods Sourcebook (3rd ed., Vol. 47, Issue Suppl **SAGE** Publications. http://www.uk.sagepub.com/books/Book239534?siteId=sage uk
- Mostafa, A. A., Youseff, K., & Abdelrahman, M. (2020). Analysis of Photovoltaics in Egypt using SWOT and PESTLE. International Journal of Applied Energy Systems, 2(1), 11-14. https://doi.org/10.21608/IJAES.2020.169936
- Münter, M. T. (2024). Pestle Analysis. Reference Module in Social Sciences. https://doi.org/10.1016/B978 0 443 13701 3.00200 0
- Nandonde, F. A. (2019). A PESTLE analysis of international retailing in the East African Community. Global Business and Organizational Excellence, 38(4), 54-61. https://doi.org/10.1002/JOE.21935;PAGEGROUP:STRING:PUBLICATION
- Portman, M. E. (2015). Marine spatial planning in the Middle East: Crossing the policy planning divide. Marine Policy. 61, 8-15. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpol.2015.06.025
- Ricci, S., Janout, V., Parker, S., Jerabek, J., Hajny, J., Chatzopoulou, A., & Badonnel, R. (2021). PESTLE Analysis of Cybersecurity Education. ACM International Conference Proceeding Series. https://doi.org/10.1145/3465481.3469184
- Sandelowski, M. (2010). What's in a name? Qualitative description revisited. Research in Nursing and Health, 33(1), 77-84. https://doi.org/10.1002/NUR.20362
- Soares, C. A., Shendrikova, D., Crevani, G., Silinto, B., & Colombo, E. (2023). Enabling factors for the development of mini grid solutions in Mozambique: A PESTLE based analysis. Energy Strategy Reviews, 45, 101040. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.ESR.2022.101040
- Walsh, K., Bhagavatheeswaran, L., & Roma, E. (2019). E learning in healthcare professional education: an analysis of political, economic, social, technological, legal and environmental (PESTLE) factors. MedEdPublish, 8, 97. https://doi.org/10.15694/MEP.2019.000097.1



Journal Governance Bureaucraric Review eISSN: 3108-9356 pISSN: 3109-0605 VOL 1 NO. 1 DECEMBER, 2024 https://ojs.umrah.ac.id/index.php/jgbr

Yudha, S. W., Tjahjono, B., & Kolios, A. (2018). A PESTLE policy mapping and stakeholder of Indonesia's energy industry. analysis fossil fuel Energies, 11(5). https://doi.org/10.3390/EN11051272

Zahari, A. R., & Romli, F. I. (2019). Analysis of suborbital flight operation using PESTLE. of Atmospheric and Solar Terrestrial Physics, Journal 192, 104901. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.JASTP.2018.08.006